# MODEL CIVIL JURY INSTRUCTIONS

FOR THE DISTRICT COURTS OF THE THIRD CIRCUIT

Prepared by
Committee on Model
Civil Jury Instructions
Within the Third Circuit

2018 Edition

# COMMITTEE ON MODEL CIVIL JURY INSTRUCTIONS THIRD CIRCUIT

## **MEMBERS**:

Judge Noel L. Hillman, Chair Judge Wendy Beetlestone Judge Matthew W. Brann Judge Renee Marie Bumb Judge Nora Barry Fischer Judge C. Darnell Jones II Judge Jerome B. Simandle Chief Judge Leonard P. Stark

#### **REPORTERS:**

Professor Edward A. Hartnett Professor Catherine T. Struve

#### STAFF:

Joel McHugh, Esq.

### **INTRODUCTION**

In the late spring of 2004 Chief Judge Anthony J. Scirica appointed a Committee of district judges to draft model civil jury instructions to help judges communicate more effectively with juries. He and the Committee recruited Professor Daniel J. Capra of Fordham University Law School and Professor Catherine T. Struve of University of Pennsylvania Law School to serve as Reporters for the Committee. Throughout its initial work the Committee and the Reporters received assistance from Circuit Executive, Toby Slawsky, and Circuit staff members Theresa Burnett, Esq. and Susan Mangino. The project was funded by generous contributions from the Court of Appeals and each District Court in the Third Circuit.\*

From 2004 until the spring of 2011, the Committee was led by Judge Dickinson R. Debevoise. Judge Debevoise's wisdom and kindness are prized by the members of the Committee. The model instructions stand as just one example of his many contributions to the improvement of the law.

<sup>\*</sup> Neither the Court of Appeals nor any Judge of that Court participated in the drafting of the Model Instructions.

The Committee commenced its work in September 2004\*\*. It decided to draft general instructions applicable in all civil jury trials and instructions covering the most common types of federal cases in which juries can be requested. An appendix is included which indicates where instructions in other causes of action can be found. The subject matter of the Model Civil Jury Instructions is set forth in the Table of Contents that follows. The extraordinary efforts of the Reporters and the scholarly strength they brought to the task of drafting these Instructions cannot be over-emphasized.

The comments the Reporters prepared that accompany each instruction proved to be so valuable that the Committee decided to include them with the final instructions. They should be useful to district court judges not only when they draft jury instructions but also when they address motions to dismiss and motions for summary judgment.

By referring to the Table of Contents beginning with General Instruction No. 1.1 and then proceeding through the Table of Contents from one instruction to the next, one may select the appropriate instruction applicable to the case at hand and thus assemble a complete charge. It must be emphasized, however, that every case is unique, having its particular fact pattern, and care must be exercised when adapting the Model Instructions to the individual case.

These Model Civil Jury Instructions remain a work in progress. The law develops as time passes. Even as the Instructions were being assembled in final form opinions of the Court of Appeals came down that required additions or revisions. Supreme Court and Court of Appeals decisions have required both major and minor revisions of the Model Instructions and Comments. Judges and lawyers who use these Instructions have submitted suggestions for improvement. All of these suggestions have been reviewed, and many have been incorporated in the Model Instructions and Comments. The Committee meets periodically with its Reporters to review developments in the law and the comments of those who use the Model Instructions. Revised print editions will continue to be issued (and made available on WestlawNext) from time to time. The Third Circuit's website always contains the most up to date version of the model instructions and commentary.

<sup>\*\*</sup> Judge Kent A. Jordan served on the Committee until his appointment to the Court of Appeals. Judge William G. Bassler served on the Committee until his retirement from the bench. Judge Gary L. Lancaster served on the Committee until 2010. As noted in the text, Judge Dickinson R. Debevoise served as Chair of the Committee until spring 2011. Judge Louis H. Pollak served on the Committee until his death in 2012. Judge A. Richard Caputo served on the Committee until 2016. Judge Mary A. McLaughlin served on the Committee until her retirement from the bench. Judge Legrome D. Davis served on the Committee until 2016. Theresa L. Burnett, Esq., provided invaluable support to the Committee until 2011, when she left her position as Assistant Circuit Executive to accept appointment as the Chief Deputy Clerk for Administration in the District of New Jersey. Professor Daniel J. Capra served as a Reporter for the Committee until March 2009. Professors Edward A. Hartnett and Catherine T. Struve are now the Committee's reporters.

The Committee hopes that this work will ease the burden of district judges in preparing their jury instructions and will also provide a technique for the rapid preparation and assembly of complete instructions in suitable form for submission to the jury.

<u>Click here</u> to link to the Table of Contents and the model civil jury instructions. The documents are provided in two formats: Word and PDF (for easy referral to just the Table of Contents, you should save the Table of Contents web page as one of your "favorites").

You may email any comments to the email address provided on the Model Jury Instructions section of the Third Circuit's website. Comments will be provided to the Committee for consideration at a future meeting.